

NATIONAL FUEL GAS DISTRIBUTION CORPORATION  
NEW YORK DIVISION  
RESPONSE TO DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE  
INTERROGATORY/DATA REQUEST  
CASE 12-M-0476

Request No: DPS-NFG1-9  
Requested By: DPS Staff  
Date of Request: September 30, 2016  
Reply Due Date: October 12, 2016  
Respondent: Michael Novak  
Subject: Utility/ESCO Bill Comparison

In February of 2014, the Commission directed the utilities to develop a historical bill calculator to compare the total bills for each incumbent utilities' residential and small C&I customers by rate class to the rate offerings of ESCOs operating within their service areas. In a manner similar to the historical price comparison noted above, and as part of Department Staff's ongoing review of the New York's retail access market performance, we request that you each provide the below information, in an EXCEL spreadsheet format, for the various ESCO commodity offerings provided within your service areas compared to the comparable default utility services. The requested utility to ESCO bill comparisons should include all ESCO charges to a utility bill for each monthly period and account for monthly adjustments to prior periods, one-time charges or short term changes in energy and natural gas prices. Please provide an explanation of how these adjustments were made and applied.

NFG4. Please provide a sample calculation summary using the above noted sample bill charges, surcharges, and adjustments to support your bill comparisons.

Response:

**ESCO Bill - Residential Customer - NFG3 Response**

ESCO Commodity	78	ccf	x	0.302692	=	\$ 23.61
Sales Tax:						\$ 1.12
Total ESCO Gas Supply Charges						<u>\$ 24.73</u>
Total Delivery Charges						<u>\$ 38.07</u>
Current Month Charges:						\$ 62.80

**Utility Bill - Residential Customer - NFG3 Response**

Utility Commodity	78	ccf	x	0.257692	=	\$ 20.10
Sales Tax:						\$ 0.95
Total Utility Gas Supply Charges						<u>\$ 21.05</u>
Total Delivery Charges						<u>\$ 38.07</u>
Current Month Charges:						\$ 59.12

Current Month Charges Comparison (Utility - ESCO)						\$ (3.68)
---	--	--	--	--	--	-----------

NATIONAL FUEL GAS DISTRIBUTION CORPORATION  
NEW YORK DIVISION  
RESPONSE TO DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE  
INTERROGATORY/DATA REQUEST  
CASE 12-M-0476

**ESCO Bill - Small C&I Customer - NFG3 Response**

ESCO Commodity	654	ccf	x	0.353456	=	\$	231.16
Sales Tax:						\$	<u>18.50</u>
Total ESCO Gas Supply Charges						\$	249.66
Total Delivery Charges						\$	<u>172.98</u>
Current Month Charges:						\$	422.64

**Utility Bill - Small C&I Customer - NFG3 Response**

Utility Commodity	654	ccf	x	0.27059633	=	\$	176.97
Sales Tax:						\$	<u>14.16</u>
Total Utility Gas Supply Charges						\$	191.13
Total Delivery Charges						\$	<u>172.98</u>
Current Month Charges:						\$	364.11

Current Month Charges Comparison (Utility - ESCO)						\$	(58.53)
---	--	--	--	--	--	----	---------